STABLE IMPLEMENTATION OF BOUNDARY CONDITIONS FOR DGSEM APPROXIMATION OF THE COMPRESSIBLE EULER AND NAVIER-STOKES EQUATIONS

> David A. Kopriva Florida State University and San Diego State University

> Gregor J. Gassner, U. Cologne and Andrew R. Winters University of Cologne

> > Florian Hindenlang Max Planck Institute

# A Flow Geometry



# A Compressible Flow



#### Another Compressible Flow



#### Boundary Conditions Determine the Flow!

Yet:

- Hardly discussed except in passing
- Often dealt with in ad-hoc manner
- Published proposals not stable

# We study...

- Conditions under which DGSEMs are stable
- Examples of stable BC implementations
- General Analysis
  - 3D
  - Curved Elements
  - Linear and nonlinear equations

#### Compressible Flow Model

Navier-Stokes Equations: Conservative form

$$\mathbf{u}_{t} + \sum_{i=1}^{3} \frac{\partial \mathbf{f}_{i}}{\partial x_{i}} = \frac{1}{\operatorname{Re}} \sum_{i=1}^{3} \frac{\partial \mathbf{f}_{v,i} \left(\mathbf{u}, \nabla_{x} \mathbf{u}\right)}{\partial x_{i}}$$

**Conservative Variables** 

$$\mathbf{u} = \begin{bmatrix} \rho \\ \rho \vec{v} \\ \rho E \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \rho \\ \rho u \\ \rho v \\ \rho w \\ \rho E \end{bmatrix}$$

# Compact Version

$$\mathbf{u}_{t} + \vec{\nabla}_{x} \cdot \dot{\mathbf{f}} = \frac{1}{\text{Re}} \vec{\nabla}_{x} \cdot \dot{\mathbf{f}}_{v} \left( \mathbf{u}, \vec{\nabla}_{x} \mathbf{u} \right)$$
Vector of Vectors:  $\dot{\mathbf{f}} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{f}_{1} \\ \mathbf{f}_{2} \\ \mathbf{f}_{2} \end{bmatrix}$ 

Write as 1st order system with

$$\dot{\mathbf{q}} = \vec{\nabla}_x \mathbf{u}$$

# DGSEM Approximation

#### Subdivide domain into elements



Curved Elements OK!

# Unstructured Grids OK



# Unstructured Grids OK



# DGSEM Approximation

#### Map Element to Reference Element



#### Transformation of Operators

$$\vec{a}_{i} = \frac{\partial X}{\partial \xi^{i}} \quad i = 1, 2, 3$$
$$\mathcal{J}\vec{a}^{i} = \vec{a}_{j} \times \vec{a}_{j}, \quad (i, j, k) \text{ cyclic}$$

Gradient

$$\vec{\nabla}_{x}\mathbf{u} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{u}_{x} \\ \mathbf{u}_{y} \\ \mathbf{u}_{z} \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{J}} \begin{bmatrix} \mathcal{J}a_{1}^{1}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} & \mathcal{J}a_{1}^{2}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} \\ \mathcal{J}a_{2}^{1}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} & \mathcal{J}a_{2}^{2}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} \\ \mathcal{J}a_{3}^{1}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} & \mathcal{J}a_{3}^{2}\underline{\mathbf{I}}_{5} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{u}_{\xi} \\ \mathbf{u}_{\eta} \\ \mathbf{u}_{\zeta} \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{J}}\mathcal{M}\vec{\nabla}_{\xi}\mathbf{u}$$

Divergence

$$\vec{\nabla}_x \cdot \dot{\mathbf{g}} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{J}} \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \cdot \left( \mathcal{M}^T \dot{\mathbf{g}} \right)$$

Define Contravariant fluxes:

$$\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{\widetilde{f}}} = \mathcal{M}^T \mathbf{\widetilde{f}}$$

### NS in Reference Coordinates $\mathcal{J}\mathbf{u}_{t} + \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \cdot \hat{\vec{\mathbf{f}}} = \frac{1}{\text{Re}} \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \cdot \hat{\vec{\mathbf{f}}}_{v} (\mathbf{u}, \vec{\mathbf{q}})$

 $\mathcal{J} \stackrel{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{q}} = \mathcal{M} \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \mathbf{u}$ 



$$\mathbf{u}_t + \vec{\nabla}_x \cdot \overleftarrow{\mathbf{f}} = \frac{1}{\text{Re}} \vec{\nabla}_x \cdot \overleftarrow{\mathbf{f}}_v \left( \mathbf{u}, \vec{\nabla}_x \mathbf{u} \right)$$
$$\overleftarrow{\mathbf{q}} = \vec{\nabla}_x \mathbf{u}$$

# Weak Form Construction $\mathcal{J}\mathbf{u}_{t} + \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \cdot \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{f}} = \frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \cdot \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{f}}_{v} (\mathbf{u}, \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{q}})$ $\mathcal{J}\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{q}} = \mathcal{M}\vec{\nabla}_{\xi}\mathbf{u}$

(1) Take inner product of equations with test functions  $\langle u, v \rangle = \int_E uv dE$ 

(2) Apply Gauss Law

$$\langle \mathcal{J}\mathbf{u}, \boldsymbol{\phi} \rangle + \int_{\partial E} \boldsymbol{\phi}^T \left\{ \dot{\tilde{\mathbf{f}}} - \frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \dot{\tilde{\mathbf{f}}}_v \right\} \cdot \hat{n} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \dot{\tilde{\mathbf{f}}}, \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \boldsymbol{\phi} \right\rangle = -\frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \left\langle \dot{\tilde{\mathbf{f}}}_v, \vec{\nabla} \boldsymbol{\phi} \right\rangle$$

$$\left\langle \mathcal{J} \overrightarrow{\mathbf{q}}, \overrightarrow{\psi} \right\rangle = \int_{\partial E} \mathbf{u}^T \left\{ \mathcal{M}^T \overrightarrow{\psi} \right\} \cdot \hat{n} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \mathbf{u}, \vec{\nabla} \cdot \left( \mathcal{M}^T \overrightarrow{\psi} \right) \right\rangle$$

# Approximate

Functions with polynomials Boundary quantities with numerical ones  $\langle \mathcal{J}\mathbf{u}, \boldsymbol{\phi} \rangle + \int_{\partial F} \boldsymbol{\phi}^T \left\{ \overleftarrow{\mathbf{\tilde{f}}} - \frac{1}{\operatorname{Re}} \overleftarrow{\mathbf{\tilde{f}}}_v \right\} \quad \hat{n} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \overleftarrow{\mathbf{\tilde{f}}}, \vec{\nabla}_{\xi} \boldsymbol{\phi} \right\rangle = -\frac{1}{\operatorname{Re}} \left\langle \overleftarrow{\mathbf{\tilde{f}}}_v, \vec{\nabla} \boldsymbol{\phi} \right\rangle$  $\left\langle \mathcal{J} \vec{\mathbf{q}}, \vec{\psi} \right\rangle = \int_{\partial E} \mathbf{u}^T \left\{ \mathcal{M}^T \vec{\psi} \right\} \cdot \hat{n} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \mathbf{u}, \vec{\nabla} \cdot \left( \mathcal{M}^T \vec{\psi} \right) \right\rangle$ 

Integrals with quadrature

### **Continuous Function** Approximation

Approximation by Polynomial Interpolant

$$U\left(\vec{\xi}\right) = \mathbb{I}^{N}(u) = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{N} u\left(\xi_{i},\eta_{j},\zeta_{k}\right) \ell_{i}\left(\xi\right) \ell_{j}\left(\eta\right) \ell_{k}\left(\zeta\right)$$

 $\ell_j(x) = \prod_{i=0: i \neq j}^N \frac{x - x_i}{x - x_j} = \text{Lagrange Interpolating Polynomial of degree } N$  $x_i = \text{Gauss Lobatto points}$ 

 $\ell_i \left( x_i \right) = \delta_{ij}$ 

#### Arbitrary High Order Acoustic Scattering from a Cylinder



74th Order

### Differentiation

Differentiate interpolant, evaluate at quadrature points

$$\frac{\partial U}{\partial \xi}\Big|_{nml} = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{N} u_{ijk}\ell'_{i}\left(\xi_{n}\right)\ell_{j}\left(\eta_{m}\right)\ell_{k}\left(\zeta_{l}\right)$$

$$=\sum_{i=0}^{N} u_{ijk}\ell'_{i}\left(\xi_{n}\right) = \sum_{i=0}^{N} u_{ijk}\mathcal{D}_{ni}$$

#### Differentiation

#### Gradient



Divergence

$$\nabla \cdot \vec{F}_{ijk} = \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathcal{D}_{in} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{ink}^{(\eta)} \mathcal{D}_{jn} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{ijn}^{(\zeta)} \mathcal{D}_{kn}$$

# Integral Approximation

#### Gauss-Lobatto Quadrature

Integration over Volume

$$\int_{E,N} gd\xi d\eta d\zeta \equiv \sum_{i,j,k=0}^{N} g_{ijk} w_{ijk}, \quad (w_{ijk} = w_i w_j w_k)$$

Defines discrete inner product/Norm

$$\langle U, V \rangle_N \equiv \int_{E,N} UV d\xi d\eta d\zeta = \sum_{i,j,k=0}^N U_{ijk} V_{ijk} w_{ijk}$$

# Summation-By-Parts

Exactness of Gauss Quadrature implies

Integration By Parts  
$$(u, v_{\xi}) = \int_{\partial E} UV|_{\xi=-1}^{1} d\eta d\zeta - (u_{\xi}, v)$$

Summation by Parts  $(U, V_{\xi})_{N} = \int_{\partial E, N} UV|_{\xi=-1}^{1} d\eta d\zeta - (U_{\xi}, V)_{N}$ 

 $\downarrow$ 

# Summation by Parts

works in each direction

F

$$\left\langle U_{\xi}, V \right\rangle_{N} = \int_{N} UV |_{\xi=-1}^{1} d\eta d\zeta - \left\langle U, V_{\xi} \right\rangle_{N}$$



$$\begin{cases} \langle U_{\eta}, V \rangle_{N} = \int_{N} UV |_{\eta=-1}^{1} d\xi d\zeta - \langle U, V_{\eta} \rangle_{N} \\ \langle U_{\zeta}, V \rangle_{N} = \int_{N} UV |_{\zeta=-1}^{1} d\xi d\zeta - \langle U, V_{\zeta} \rangle_{N} \\ F_{3} \end{cases}$$





#### Discrete Gauss Law

$$\left(\nabla \cdot \vec{F}, \phi\right)_N = \int_{\partial E, N} \vec{F} \cdot \hat{n} dS - \left(\vec{F}, \nabla \phi\right)_N$$

### Discrete Integral Calculus

$$\left(\nabla \cdot \vec{F}, \phi\right)_{N} = \int_{\partial E, N} \vec{F} \cdot \hat{n} dS - \left(\vec{F}, \nabla \phi\right)_{N}$$

$$\int_{E,N} \nabla \cdot \vec{F} d\vec{\xi} = \int_{\partial E,N} \vec{F} \cdot \hat{n} dS$$

$$\left(\nabla^2 \Phi, V\right)_N + \left(\nabla \Phi, \nabla V\right)_N = \int_{\partial E, N} \nabla \Phi \cdot \hat{n} V dS$$

$$\left(\nabla^2 \Phi, V\right)_N - \left(\nabla^2 V, \Phi\right)_N = \int_{\partial E, N} \left(\nabla \Phi \cdot \hat{n}V - \nabla V \cdot \hat{n}\Phi\right) dS$$

#### From Exactness

$$\int_{E,N} \nabla V d\xi d\eta d\zeta = \int_{\partial E,N} V \hat{n} dS$$

$$\int_{E,N} \nabla \times \vec{F} d\xi d\eta d\zeta = \int_{\partial E,N} \hat{n} \times \vec{F} dS$$

# Coupling-Advective

**Riemann Solver** 

$$\mathbf{F}^{*}\left(\mathbf{U}^{L},\mathbf{U}^{R}\right) = \frac{\overrightarrow{\mathbf{f}}\left(\mathbf{U}^{L}\right)\cdot\hat{n} + \overrightarrow{\mathbf{f}}\left(\mathbf{U}^{L}\right)\cdot\hat{n}}{2} + \frac{\sigma}{2}\left|\overline{A}\right|\left(\mathbf{U}^{L} - \mathbf{U}^{R}\right)$$

$$=\left\{\left\{\overrightarrow{\mathbf{f}}\cdot\hat{n}\right\}\right\}-\frac{\sigma}{2}\left|\overline{A}\right|\left[\left[\mathbf{U}\right]\right]$$

Roe Lax-Friedrichs van Leer

# Coupling - Diffusive

Bassi-Rebay-1:

 $\mathbf{U}^* \left( \mathbf{U}^L, \mathbf{U}^R \right) = \frac{\mathbf{U}^L + \mathbf{U}^R}{2} = \{\!\!\{\mathbf{U}\}\!\!\}$ 

$$\mathbf{F}_{v}^{*}\left(\ddot{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}^{L}\cdot\hat{n},\ddot{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}^{R}\cdot\hat{n}\right) = \{\!\!\{\dot{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\}\!\!\}$$

Others... Bassi-Rebay-2 Interior Penalty

#### Weak Form Construction...

Apply Gauss Law again...

Split Form/Two Point Flux  

$$\vec{f} = \vec{A}(x)\mathbf{u}$$
Split Form:  $\nabla \cdot \vec{f} = \frac{1}{2} \left\{ \nabla \cdot \vec{f} + \vec{A} \cdot \nabla u + \nabla \cdot \vec{A}u \right\}$ 

$$\frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \cdot \vec{\mathbf{F}} (\mathbf{U}), \phi \right)_{N} + \frac{1}{2} \left( \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{A} \right) \cdot \nabla \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N} + \frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \cdot \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{A} \right) \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N}$$

$$\phi = \ell_{i}\ell_{j}\ell_{k}$$

#### Volume Terms

$$\left(\nabla \cdot \overrightarrow{\mathbf{F}}(\mathbf{U}), \phi\right)_{N} \longrightarrow w_{ijk} \left\{ \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathcal{D}_{in} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{ink}^{(\eta)} \mathcal{D}_{jn} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} F_{ijn}^{(\zeta)} \mathcal{D}_{kn} \right\}$$

$$\left( \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{\mathcal{A}} \right) \cdot \nabla \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N} \longrightarrow$$

$$w_{ijk} \left\{ \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathbf{U}_{njk} \mathcal{D}_{in} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\eta)} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathbf{U}_{ink} \mathcal{D}_{jn} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\zeta)} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathbf{U}_{ijn} \mathcal{D}_{kn} \right\}$$

$$\left( \nabla \cdot \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{\mathcal{A}} \right) \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N} \longrightarrow$$

$$w_{ijk} \left\{ \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathcal{D}_{in} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathcal{A}_{ink}^{(\eta)} \mathcal{D}_{jn} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\zeta)} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathcal{A}_{ijn}^{(\zeta)} \mathcal{D}_{kn} \right\} \mathbf{U}_{ijk}$$

n=0

 $n\eta$ 

n=0

ink

 $\kappa n$ 

ijn '

ijk

n=0

### Volume Terms

$$\frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \cdot \vec{\mathbf{F}} \left( \mathbf{U} \right), \phi \right)_{N} + \frac{1}{2} \left( \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{\mathcal{A}} \right) \cdot \nabla \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N} + \frac{1}{2} \left( \nabla \cdot \mathbb{I}^{N} \left( \vec{\mathcal{A}} \right) \mathbf{U}, \phi \right)_{N} \right)_{N}$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathbf{F}_{njk}^{(\xi)} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{in} w_{ijk}$$

$$- \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathbf{F}_{ink}^{(\eta)} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\eta)} \mathbf{U}_{ink} + \mathcal{A}_{ink}^{(\eta)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{jn} w_{ijk}$$

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathbf{F}_{njk}^{(\zeta)} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\zeta)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\zeta)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{kn} w_{ijk}$$

+

 $=\sum_{n=0}^{N} \overline{\mathbf{F}}_{(njk,i)}^{(\xi)} \mathcal{D}_{in} w_{ijk} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} \overline{\mathbf{F}}_{(ink,j)}^{(\eta)} \mathcal{D}_{jn} w_{ijk} + \sum_{n=0}^{N} \overline{\mathbf{F}}_{(ijn,k)}^{(\zeta)} \mathcal{D}_{kn} w_{ijk}$ 

# Special Averages

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathbf{F}_{njk}^{(\xi)} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{in} + \frac{1}{2} \qquad \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathcal{D}_{in} = \sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \mathcal{D}_{in} = 0$$
$$= 0$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{in}$$

# Special Averages

$$= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{njk} + \mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} + \mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)} \mathbf{U}_{ijk} \right\} \mathcal{D}_{in}$$

$$=2\sum_{n=0}^{N}\left\{\left(\frac{\mathcal{A}_{njk}^{(\xi)}+\mathcal{A}_{ijk}^{(\xi)}}{2}\right)\left(\frac{\mathbf{U}_{njk}+\mathbf{U}_{ijk}}{2}\right)\right\}\mathcal{D}_{in}$$

$$= 2\sum_{n=0}^{N} \left\{ \left\{ \mathcal{A}^{(\xi)} \right\} \right\}_{(n,i)jk} \left\{ \{\mathbf{U}\} \right\}_{(n,i)jk} \mathcal{D}_{in}$$
$$= 2\sum_{n=0}^{N} \mathbf{F}_{(n,i)jk}^{\#} D_{in}$$

# Key Ingredient

#### Summation-By-Parts and form of **F**<sup>#</sup> implies

$$\langle \mathbb{D}\mathbf{F}^{\#},\mathbf{U}\rangle = \frac{1}{2} \int_{\partial E,N} \mathbf{U}^{T} \vec{\mathbf{F}} \cdot \hat{n} dS$$

Volume term replaced by surface quadrature Control with numerical flux

# DGSEM

$$\left\langle \mathcal{J}\mathbf{U}_{t},\boldsymbol{\phi}\right\rangle_{N}+\int_{\partial E,N}\boldsymbol{\phi}^{T}\left\{\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^{*}}-\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{f}}}\cdot\hat{n}-\frac{1}{\operatorname{Re}}\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^{*}}_{v}\right\}\,\mathrm{dS}-\left\langle \mathbb{D}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{F}^{\#}}\right),\boldsymbol{\phi}\right\rangle_{N}=-\frac{1}{\operatorname{Re}}\left\langle \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v},\vec{\nabla}\boldsymbol{\phi}\right\rangle_{N}$$

$$\left\langle \mathcal{J} \overrightarrow{\mathbf{Q}}, \overrightarrow{\psi} \right\rangle_{N} = \int_{\partial E, N} \left\{ \mathbf{U}^{**, T} - \mathbf{U} \right\} \left\{ \mathcal{M}^{T} \overrightarrow{\psi} \right\} \cdot \hat{n} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \mathbf{U}, \vec{\nabla} \cdot \left( \mathcal{M}^{T} \overrightarrow{\psi} \right) \right\rangle_{N}$$

$$\begin{split} & \left\{ \mathcal{J}\mathbf{U}_{t}, \phi \right\}_{N} + \int_{\partial E, N} \phi^{T} \left\{ \ddot{\mathbf{F}}^{*} - \ddot{\mathbf{f}}^{*} \cdot \hat{\mathbf{n}} - \frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \ddot{\mathbf{F}}^{*}_{v} \right\} \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \mathbb{D} \left( \ddot{\mathbf{F}}^{\#} \right), \phi \right\rangle_{N} = -\frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \left\langle \ddot{\mathbf{F}}^{*} , \vec{\nabla} \phi \right\rangle_{N} \\ & \left\langle \mathcal{J} \ddot{\mathbf{Q}}, \ddot{\psi} \right\rangle_{N} = \int_{\partial E, N} \left\{ \mathbf{U}^{**, T} - \mathbf{U} \right\} \left\{ \mathcal{M}^{T} \ddot{\psi} \right\} \cdot \hat{n} \, \, \mathrm{dS} - \left\langle \mathbf{U}, \vec{\nabla} \cdot \left( \mathcal{M}^{T} \ddot{\psi} \right) \right\rangle_{N} \end{split}$$

Linear

Entropy

Linearize equations
 Replace φ=(S<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>T</sup>S<sup>-1</sup>U
 ψ ← BQ
 Sum over all elements

• Replace  $\phi \leftarrow W$  $\psi \leftarrow \beta \nabla W$ • Sum over all elements

# Linear Energy Bound

$$\frac{d}{dt} \sum_{elements} \left| \left| \mathbf{U} \right| \right|_{J,N}^2 \leq -2 \sum_{\text{Boundary}} \int_{\partial E,N} \left\{ \left[ \tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right]^T \mathbf{U} - \frac{1}{\text{Re}} \left[ \tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^{*,T} \mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T} \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) - \mathbf{U}^T \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right] \right\} \, \mathrm{dS}$$

#### Sufficient Condition for Stability:

$$\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right]^T \mathbf{U} - \frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \left[ \tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^{*,T} \mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T} \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) - \mathbf{U}^T \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right] \ge \mathbf{0}$$

• 3D

Curved Hex Elements

Any Polynomial Order

# BC Implementation

BC Implementations are stable if

$$\left(\mathsf{SSC}\right)\left[\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^*-\frac{1}{2}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}\cdot\hat{n}\right)\right]^T\mathbf{U}-\frac{1}{\mathsf{Re}}\left[\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^{*,T}\mathbf{U}+\mathbf{U}^{*,T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v\cdot\hat{n}\right)-\mathbf{U}^T\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v\cdot\hat{n}\right)\right]\geq\mathbf{0}\right]$$

Dirichlet-Type

Neumann-Type

#### **Robin-Type Conditions**

# Typical Implementation

 $(\mathsf{E}) \left[ \tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right]^T \mathbf{U} \ge \mathbf{0}$ 

Euler Part

(D)  $\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*,T}\mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right) - \mathbf{U}^{T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right)\right] \leq \mathbf{0}$  Navier-Stokes Part

Sufficient, but not necessary

### Examples

- Euler Inflow/Outlfow
- Euler Free-Slip Wall
- Navier-Stokes Inflow-Outflow
- Navier-Stokes Wall

#### Linear-Symmetric Equations

$$\mathbb{N} = (U, V, W) \cdot \hat{n}$$
$$\mathbb{U} = \begin{bmatrix} \rho \\ U \\ V \\ W \\ P \end{bmatrix} \qquad \vec{\mathbf{F}} \cdot \hat{n} = \begin{bmatrix} b\mathbb{N} \\ n_x(\rho b + aP) \\ n_y(\rho b + aP) \\ n_z(\rho b + aP) \\ a\mathbb{N} \end{bmatrix} \qquad a^2 + b^2 = c^2$$



Specify Free Stream in Upwind Riemann Solver  $\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* (\mathbf{U}^L, \mathbf{U}^R) = \left\{ \left\{ \tilde{A} \cdot \hat{n} \mathbf{U} \right\} \right\} - \frac{\left| \tilde{A} \cdot \hat{n} \right|}{2} \left[ \left[ \mathbf{U} \right] \right] = A^+ \mathbf{U}^L + A^- \mathbf{U}^R$ 

(E) 
$$\left(\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n}\right)^T \mathbf{U} \ge \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{U}^T \underline{\mathbf{A}}^+ \mathbf{U} \ge 0$$

### Euler Free-Slip Wall

Specify No Normal Velocity  $F^*$  $\mathbb{N} = (U, V, W) \cdot \hat{n} = 0$ 

$$= \begin{bmatrix} 0\\ n_x (b\rho + aP)\\ n_y (b\rho + aP)\\ n_z (b\rho + aP)\\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$



$$(\mathsf{E}) \quad \mathbf{U}^{T} \left( \mathbf{F}^{*} - \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{F} \cdot \hat{n} \right) = \begin{bmatrix} \rho & U & V & W & P \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} -b\mathbb{N} \\ n_{x} \left( b\rho + aP \right) \\ n_{y} \left( b\rho + aP \right) \\ n_{z} \left( b\rho + aP \right) \\ -a\mathbb{N} \end{bmatrix} = 0 \qquad \checkmark$$

# Euler Free-Slip Wall

Equal & Opposite in Upwind Riemann Solver



$$\left(\mathbf{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right)^{ext}\equiv\mathbb{N}^{ext}=-\left(\mathbf{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right)^{int}\equiv-\mathbb{N}^{int}$$

 $\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* \left( \mathbf{U}^L, \mathbf{U}^R \right) = \left\{ \left\{ \tilde{A} \cdot \hat{n} \mathbf{U} \right\} \right\} - \frac{\left| \tilde{A} \cdot \hat{n} \right|}{2} \left[ \left[ \mathbf{U} \right] \right] = A^+ \mathbf{U}^L + A^- \mathbf{U}^R$ 

(E) 
$$\left(\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n}\right)^T \mathbf{U} = \mathbf{C} \mathbb{N}^2 \ge 0$$

### Navier-Stokes Inflow



Specify Ext State (E)  $\left(\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n}\right)^T \mathbf{U} \ge \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{U}^T \underline{A}^+ \mathbf{U} \ge 0$   $\checkmark$ (D)  $\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^{*,T} \mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T} \left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n}\right) - \mathbf{U}^T \left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n}\right)\right]$ 

#### Navier-Stokes Inflow

(D)  $\begin{bmatrix} \tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*,T}\mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T} & (\stackrel{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v} \cdot \hat{n} \end{pmatrix} - \mathbf{U}^{T} & (\stackrel{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v} \cdot \hat{n} \end{pmatrix} \end{bmatrix} = 0$   $\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*} = \stackrel{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v} \cdot \hat{n}$ Compute Flux from Interior

 $(\mathsf{E}) + (\mathsf{D}) = \left(\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^* - \frac{1}{2} \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n}\right)^T \mathbf{U} \ge \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{U}^T \underline{A}^+ \mathbf{U} \ge 0$ 

### Navier-Stokes Outflow



(E) 
$$\left(\tilde{\mathbf{F}}^{*} - \frac{1}{2}\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}\cdot\hat{n}\right)^{T}\mathbf{U} \geq \frac{1}{2}\mathbf{U}^{T}\underline{\mathbf{A}}^{+}\mathbf{U} \geq 0$$
  
(D)  $\left[\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*,T}\mathbf{U} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right) - \mathbf{U}^{T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right)\right] = \mathbf{0}$   
 $\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*} = 0$   
 $\mathbf{U}^{*} = \mathbf{U}$   
Use interior Solution

### Navier-Stokes Wall

Satisfy (E) through Riemann Solver Re-Write (D)

$$\mathbf{U}^{T}\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right) - \mathbf{U}^{T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right) = \mathbf{U}^{T}\left\{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_{v}^{*} - \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right\} + \mathbf{U}^{*,T}\left(\overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_{v}\cdot\hat{n}\right) \leq 0$$

Written out...

$$\begin{bmatrix} \rho & U & V & W & P \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ \tau_1^* - \tau_1 \\ \tau_2^* - \tau_2 \\ \tau_3^* - \tau_3 \\ r \left(\frac{\partial P^*}{\partial n} - \frac{\partial P}{\partial n}\right) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} \rho^* & U^* & V^* & W^* & P^* \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ \tau_1 \\ \tau_2 \\ \tau_3 \\ r \left(\frac{\partial P}{\partial n} - \frac{\partial P}{\partial n}\right) \end{bmatrix} \leq 0,$$

 $\tau_i = n_x \tau_{i1} + n_y \tau_{i2} + n_z \tau_{i3}$ 

#### Navier-Stokes Wall

$$\begin{bmatrix} \rho & U & V & W & P \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ \tau_1^* - \tau_1 \\ \tau_2^* - \tau_2 \\ \tau_3^* - \tau_3 \\ r \left(\frac{\partial P^*}{\partial n} - \frac{\partial P}{\partial n}\right) \end{bmatrix} + \begin{bmatrix} \rho^* & U^* & V^* & W^* & P^* \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ \tau_1 \\ \tau_2 \\ \tau_3 \\ r \left(\frac{\partial P}{\partial n} - \frac{\partial P}{\partial n}\right) \end{bmatrix} \leq 0,$$

Vanishes if

$$\tau_i^* = \tau_i \qquad \qquad U^* = V^* = W^* = 0$$

+

Isothermal  $P^* = 0$   $\frac{\partial P^*}{\partial n} = \frac{\partial P}{\partial n}$  Adiabatic  $P^* = P$  $\frac{\partial P^*}{\partial n} = 0$ 

#### Not so fast...

A Guide to the Implementation of Boundary Conditions... AIAA 2014

Use interior Solution  $\mathbf{U}^* = \mathbf{U}$ Viscous Flux from Interior:  $\tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^* = \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n}$ 

### Nonlinear: Entropy Bound

$$\begin{split} \frac{d}{t}\overline{S} &\leqslant -\sum_{\substack{\text{Boundary}\\\text{faces}}} \int\limits_{N} \left\{ (\mathbf{W})^T \left( \tilde{\mathbf{F}}^{\text{ec},*} - \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{F}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right) + \left( \overset{\rightarrow}{F}^{\epsilon} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right\} \, \mathrm{dS} \\ &+ \frac{1}{\mathrm{Re}} \sum_{\substack{\text{Boundary}\\\text{faces}}} \int\limits_{N} \left\{ \mathbf{W}^T \left( \tilde{\mathbf{F}}^*_v - \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{F}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right) + (\mathbf{W}^*)^T \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\mathbf{F}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right\} \, \mathrm{dS} \,, \end{split}$$

#### Sufficient Condition for Stability

$$-\left\{ (\mathbf{W})^T \left( \tilde{\mathbf{F}}^{\text{ec},*} - \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right) + \left( \overset{\rightarrow}{\tilde{F}} \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right\} + \frac{1}{\text{Re}} \left\{ \mathbf{W}^T \left( \tilde{\mathbf{F}}_v^* - \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right) + (\mathbf{W}^*)^T \left( \overset{\leftrightarrow}{\tilde{\mathbf{F}}}_v \cdot \hat{n} \right) \right\} \le 0$$

# TO DO

- Robin Conditions
- Entropy BCs

Issues: Linear theory well understood

Linear Stability A Nonlinear Stability Entropy function not unique A stable procedure with one entropy function may not be stable with another.

# Summary

Have linear and entropy stability bounds to establish stability of DGSEM Approximations for

Arbitrary 3D geometries

- Curved elements
- Any polynomial order

Bounds establish stable boundary procedures

Approach extends to, Shallow water, MHD eqns., ...

See Andrew's talk